
**COMPARISON OF RECRUITMENT STRATEGIES OF HMJ BUSINESS OF
BALIKPAPAN STATE POLYTECHNIC AND HMJ STATISTICS OF KALIMANTAN
INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY**

**Alisha Nursyifa, Ferdy Novri*, Resty Mardahayu, Selfi, Mauriel Debora Regina, Fauzziyah
Nurul Izzah**

Department of Business, Balikpapan State Polytechnic

*Corresponding author: ferdy.novri@poltekba.ac.id

Abstract

A recruitment strategy is a very important thing in human resource management that aims to ensure the organization gets the best individuals who can help achieve its strategic goals. An effective recruitment process is one of the keys to the success of an organization in managing quality human resources. This study aims to analyze recruitment strategies in student organizations, especially the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic and the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology to ensure the sustainability and quality of member development. The methods used in this study are literature review, interviews with organizational administrators, and observations of the recruitment process carried out in the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic and the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology. The results of the study show that organizations that successfully implement the right recruitment strategy, by using social media, counseling at campus events, and selection based on interest and ability, are able to attract qualified and highly committed members. In addition, good human resource management in the organization can support increased active participation of members in various organizational activities. Based on these findings, it is recommended that student organizations design more innovative and inclusive recruitment strategies to create better human resource development.

Keywords: Comparison, Human resources, Recruitment, Strategic.

INTRODUCTION

Strategy analysis in recruiting members is essential to ensure organizations can attract and retain quality talent. In the context of intense competition, an effective recruitment strategy helps organizations understand their specific needs and create a purposeful plan. Good hiring requires a diverse approach, including the use of social media, direct communication, and the use of technology to improve efficiency. By formulating the right strategy, organizations can not only attract new members but also build a positive reputation that attracts qualified candidates. In the midst of the ever-growing era of globalization and increasingly fierce business competition, the role of human resources has become very important in determining the success of an organization. The term organization is certainly familiar to the ears of the public, especially by intellectuals who are receiving higher education. HMJ, which stands for Department Student Association, is one example of an organization in higher education that accommodates students in a department or study program. In running and developing their business, every company or organization urgently needs order of resources so that they can always achieve progress and achieve maximum income. One of the steps needed to achieve this goal is to have a team of human resources who are experts and experienced

in all fields. Therefore, the company is expected to pay attention to the quality of its human resources. One of the activities in human resource management is recruitment. Successful recruitment and appropriate placement can result in benefits for both team members and the organization, creating close cooperation between the organization's target and individual talents (Sakti *et al.*, 2023). Conducting recruitment carefully and ensuring that the qualifications are in accordance with the requirements of the organization allows the company's objectives to be optimally achieved, and ensuring that the recruitment costs are proportional to the quality of the candidates employed.

Based on the background that has been expressed, the following problem formulation can be made:

1. What are the strategies used in recruiting new members of the Business Department Student Association at the Balikpapan State Polytechnic and the Statistics Study Program Student Association of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology?
2. How effective is the recruitment strategy implemented in improving the performance of organizational members?
3. What are the factors that influence the success of a new member recruitment strategy in the context of a student organization?
4. What is the relationship between selecting the right candidate and achieving organizational goals?
5. What are the potential improvements that can be implemented to improve the recruitment process of new members in both institutions?

From the formulation of the problem that has been designed, this study aims to analyze the recruitment strategy implemented by the Business Department Student Association at the Balikpapan State Polytechnic and the Statistics Study Program Student Association of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology, as well as assess the effectiveness of the strategy in improving the performance of organizational members.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Recruitment is a series of activities in the process of searching, selecting, and withdrawing prospective employees or members to fill available positions or jobs in an organization or company, in accordance with the terms and criteria determined by the organization or company. Hanggraeni (2012: 53) emphasizes that recruitment is the process of finding and attracting applicants who have the skills to occupy certain positions in the organization. Recruitment Process Indicators According to Teguh (2009: 106) recruitment process indicators (Lubis & Nainggolan, 2019) are:

1. Recruitment planning
2. Method recruit
3. Implementation time
4. Recruitment resources

Recruitment Techniques refer to the various methods or strategies used by companies or organizations to attract, select, and assess the right candidates for available positions. The main goal of recruitment is to find candidates who best suit the needs of the organization, both in terms of skills, experience, and company culture. In carrying out recruitment techniques for prospective employees in a company must be carried out in accordance with the techniques that have been described by the company, there are recruitment techniques that can be carried out with two basic principles according to (Suwatrio & Priansa, 2018 in Gea *et al.*, 2024), namely:

1. Centralized Recruitment Techniques, if recruitment is centralized, the agency that manages human resources will be responsible for requesting from the leaders of the organization periodic estimates of the number and type of new jobs needed in the future.
2. Desantralized Recruitment Technique, recruitment in this way is always used for professional, scientific, or administrative positions for a certain agency. Each agency usually chooses to conduct recruitment in a decentralized manner because it can directly control the recruitment process. Every company or organization has an application form that is usually drafted according to their specific needs. The application form is arranged in such a way that it can contain various important information about the applicant. (Arini & Muhlis, 2020)

The Source of Potential Candidates according to Wukir (2013), wrote that after being determined related to the recruitment process through the evaluation of human resource planning, the recruitment method can be determined to obtain prospective members of the organization. The source of recruitment can come from both internal and external to the organization (Hasan, 2022). According to Danumiharja (2014), internal methods can be carried out through announcements on the announcement board, word of mouth, personnel letters, promotion lists based on performance, skills or seniority, potential ratings (Hasan, 2022).

Recruitment Quality is the quality or effectiveness of the recruitment process in an organization, which is related to the company's ability to attract, select, and obtain candidates that best suit the needs and objectives of the organization. The recruitment and selection process must also be carried out in compliance with the principles of transparency, accountability, and non-discrimination. This includes open and fair job postings, assessment of candidates based on objective criteria, and equal treatment of all applicants regardless of gender, race, religion, or other background. (Yansen, 2024)

(Wiyatna & Kasman, 2019) The success of employee recruitment in an organization greatly determines the success of the realization of the organization's own goals. Good recruitment is recruitment that can answer the needs of the job prepared by the organization. Therefore, this study aims to investigate how the role of these elements in analyzing the recruitment strategy of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic Business Department Student Association and the Kalimantan Institute of Technology Statistics Study Program Student Association in organizational development.

RESEARCH METHODS

This study uses a comparative qualitative approach with the aim of evaluating the differences in recruitment strategies implemented by the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic and the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology. This research is descriptive with a comparative design, which aims to identify similarities and differences in processes, techniques, sources of prospective members, and the quality of recruitment in both student organizations.

The subjects of the study include the general chairmen of the two student organizations, as well as organizational coaches from the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology. This research was carried out at the Balikpapan State Polytechnic campus and the Kalimantan Institute of Technology, with the addition of online interviews to support data collection from parties who could not be contacted directly.

Data collection methods include document analysis, focusing on keywords and themes related to strategy management, as well as written or structured interviews with managers or executive

officers of companies or organizations (Arista *et al.*, 2022; Azzahra & Wulandari, 2019; Cindy, 2021; Dewi & Sandora, 2019 in Syahputra *et al.*, 2023). Structured interviews were conducted with the core management of both organizations to gain in-depth information on recruitment strategies, challenges faced, and successes achieved. In addition, online interviews were conducted with the supervisors of the ITK Statistics Study Program Student Association through an online communication platform, to understand the role of coaches in supporting the recruitment process and the strategies implemented. Document studies are carried out by analyzing various documents and reports related to the recruitment process, such as registration forms, recruitment guides, and selection result data.

The data obtained was analyzed thematically with a comparative approach to identify the patterns and differences in recruitment strategies implemented by the two organizations. This analysis aims to provide an in-depth understanding of the key elements of an effective recruitment process as well as provide recommendations for future recruitment strategy improvements.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Recruitment Process

In the results of the interview conducted with the head of the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology, it was concluded that the organization carried out an effective recruitment process where we could read the contents of the minds of prospective members, by means of written tests or interviews or oral. Various preparations were also made by preparing various stages starting from the preparation of files, such as transcripts of grades and special portfolios for the Scientific Division and requirements, as well as preparing a place to conduct the interview process. The preparation time carried out to carry out the recruitment process is 2 weeks. This is also strengthened by the opinion of Mrs. Surya Puspita Sari as the Supervisor of the Statistics Study Program Student Association of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology that effective recruitment at each stage has a different function to find out the potential of its prospective members.

The Balikpapan State Polytechnic Business Department Student Association drew the conclusion that an effective recruitment process depends on the needs and direction of the organization, which will be what the direction of movement of this organization will be, where it will be taken, and the needs of it. File preparation is also one of the processes in recruiting prospective members

By preparing several requirements such as a cadre certificate, at least in semester 2, and ready to be committed and responsible during the current period.

The organizational coach also has a role in the recruitment process because the chairman of the organization will exchange ideas and ask for input from the coach regarding the prospective members to be recruited.

Technical-Technical Rector

Based on the results of the interview, it was concluded that the most effective recruitment technique according to the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology and the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic is the interview technique because we can see the picture needed to see the potential of each prospective member.

The role of technology is also very important. According to Tessema *et al.*, (2020) in the recruitment process, a technology-based approach in recruitment and selection not only helps in attracting potential employees but also in assessing and selecting the most qualified candidates (Bagus Susanto *et al.*, 2024).

The technique carried out by the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology if the candidate accepted in the recruitment does not meet expectations in the first few months is to give a warning letter up to three times and when given a warning for the third time, the new member is expelled.

The action taken by the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic when the candidate does not meet expectations, namely by evaluating and exploring what is not in accordance with *the open recruitment* process so that the member has not been able to provide maximum performance.

Source of Potential Candidates

In the results of the interview conducted with the head of the Statistics Study Program Student Association of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology, it was concluded that in reaching passive candidates, the organization sees the character of new Statistics students through the process of introducing campus life for new students (PKKMB) and has a special team to handle new members of the organization who are passive.

The action taken by the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic in reaching out to passive candidates in the organization, namely analyzing what is needed or desired by the members of the organization such as how the members adapt to the organization, so that they can see the difference in the experience of passive and active members.

The Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology uses social media in the candidate search process by disseminating information through WhatsApp and Instagram.

The Balikpapan State Polytechnic Business Student Association uses social media in the candidate search process by distributing posters through Instagram social media. Today, many organizations are making processes efficient, accurate, easy and convenient. One of the recruitment systems developed is by using information technology and other internet technology support, for example by utilizing social media in the implementation of these processes. (Husna *et al.*, 2021).

Mutu Rector

The action taken by the Kalimantan Institute of Technology Statistics Study Program Student Association in ensuring whether prospective members of the organization have a clear understanding of the organization's vision and mission is to provide assistance to ask for various information related to the organization. This is also emphasized by the opinion of Mrs. Surya Puspita Sari as the Supervisor of the Statistics Study Program Student Association of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology that by communicating and debating a question and answer session from lecturers to prospective members, related to how they view the organization through the questions asked.

The strategy carried out by the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic in ensuring whether prospective members of the organization have a deep understanding of the vision and mission of the organization is when the general deliberation is held, because from the general deliberation the vision and mission of the general chairman and vice

chairman are conveyed which can be an overview to prospective members of the organization to see what this organization is moving like in the future and the steps that will be taken. It is done by the chairman and deputy chairman if they are faced with a problem.

Table 1. Comparison of recruitment strategies between the student association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic and the student association of the statistics study program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology

Aspects	Student Association of Statistics Study Program, Kalimantan Institute of Technology	Student Association of Statistics Study Program, Kalimantan Institute of Technology
Recruitment Process	-The recruitment process is tested by interview or oral. -Prospective members prepare several requirements such as a cadre certificate, have taken at least 2 semesters, and are ready to commit and be responsible during the current period.	- The recruitment process is tested in writing or by interview or oral. - Prospective members prepare various stages starting from the preparation of files, such as transcripts of grades and portfolios specific to the Scientific Division and requirements, as well as preparing a place to conduct the interview process.
Recruitment Process	-The recruitment process is tested by interview or oral. -Prospective members prepare several requirements such as a cadre certificate, have taken at least 2 semesters, and are ready to commit and be responsible during the current period.	If the candidate accepted in the recruitment does not meet expectations in the first few months, it is to give a warning letter up to three times and when given a warning for the third time, the new member is expelled.
Source of Potential Candidates	-Analyze what members of the organization need or want, such as how the member adapts to the organization, so that you can see the difference in the experience of passive and active members. -Distribute posters through Instagram social media.	-Reaching out to passive candidates, the organization sees the character of new Statistics students through the process of introducing campus life for new students (PKKMB) and has a special team to handle new members of the passive organization. -Utilizing social media in the candidate search process by disseminating information through WhatsApp and Instagram.
Mutu Rector	The way the organization ensures that prospective members of the organization have a deep understanding of the vision and mission of the organization is when the general deliberation is held, because from the general deliberation the vision and mission of the general chairman and vice chairman are conveyed which can be an illustration to the prospective members of the organization to see what this organization is moving in the future and the steps that the general chairman and vice chairman will take if faced with a problem.	The way the organization ensures that prospective members of the organization have a clear understanding of the organization's vision and mission is by providing assistance to ask for various information related to the organization.

CONCLUSION

This study analyzes the comparison of recruitment strategies between the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic and the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology, focusing on the process, techniques, sources of prospective members, and the quality of recruitment. In terms of the recruitment process, the Kalimantan Institute of Technology Statistics Study Program Student Association involves written selection and interviews with complete files such as a special portfolio for the Scientific division and transcripts of grades. On the other hand, the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic emphasizes more on oral interviews, accompanied by information such as cadre certificates and at least in semester 2. Interview techniques are used by both organizations to evaluate a candidate's potential. However, if the candidate does not meet expectations, the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology implements a gradual warning system until dismissal, while the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic re-evaluates the recruitment process.

In terms of the source of prospective members, the two associations use social media such as Instagram and WhatsApp to disseminate recruitment information. The Kalimantan Institute of Technology Statistics Study Program Student Association also utilizes the Campus Life Introduction Activity (PKKMB) to reach passive candidates and form a special team to handle active members. Meanwhile, the Balikpapan State Polytechnic Business Department Student Association emphasizes more on analyzing member needs and adaptation strategies to ensure better participation in the organization. These approaches reflect flexibility in adapting recruitment strategies to the conditions of each organization.

In terms of recruitment quality, the Student Association of the Statistics Study Program of the Kalimantan Institute of Technology ensures that prospective members understand the vision and mission of the organization through direct mentoring, while the Student Association of the Business Department of the Balikpapan State Polytechnic takes advantage of large deliberations to convey organizational goals and plans to prospective members. This research shows that innovative and flexible recruitment strategies can attract qualified members, increase participation, and support organizational sustainability. Therefore, the use of technology and the implementation of a more inclusive approach are important steps to improve the effectiveness of the recruitment process in the future.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

With full gratitude, the author expressed his gratitude to God Almighty. His presence who always accompanies and provides infinite grace and gifts, allows the author to complete this scientific paper well.

The author also wants to express his deep appreciation to Mr. Ferdy Novri. for his guidance and support during this research. Without his help, the results of this research would not have been achieved.

This article was written by a team consisting of Alisha Nursyifa, Ferdy Novri, Resty Mardahayu, Selfi, Mauriel Debora Regina, and Fauziyyah Nurul Izzah. Each member contributes with high enthusiasm.

Finally, the author would like to thank colleagues who have provided moral support during the process of writing this article. Without the cooperation of all parties, this achievement would not have been possible. Hopefully this article is useful for the development of science.

REFERENCES

- Arini, R., & Muhlis, A. (2020). Manajemen Strategik Mutu Rekrutmen Tenaga Kependidikan Di Institut Agama Islam Negeri Madura. *Re-JIEM (Research Journal of Islamic Education Management)*, 3(1), 29–41. <https://doi.org/10.19105/re-jiem.v3i1.3485>
- Bagus Susanto, D., Hamzali, S., Penelitian, A., Kunci, K., Teknologi, P., Karyawan, R., & Karyawan, S. (2024). Peran Teknologi dalam Meningkatkan Efektivitas Rekrutmen dan Seleksi Karyawan The Role of Technology in Improving the Effectiveness of Employee Recruitment and Selection. *Jur Jurnal Kolaboratif Sains*, 7(8), 2746–2757. <https://doi.org/10.56338/jks.v7i8.5898>
- Gea, J. P. J., Mendrofa, S. A., Waruwu, M. H., & Waruwu, E. (2024). Analisis Metode Dan Teknik Rekrutmen Karyawan Pada PT. Elnusa Petrofin Kecamatan Gunungsitoli Idanoi Kota Gunungsitoli. *Jurnal Ekonomi Bisnis, Manajemen Dan Akuntansi (JEBMA)*, 4(2), 1049–1064. <https://doi.org/10.47709/jebma.v4i2.3957>
- Hasan, H. (2022). Sistem Rekrutmen Dalam Pengembangan Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia (SDM) Pendidikan. *Promis*, 3(2), 144–162.
- Husna, J., Prasetya, A., Shadiqin, S., Pungki, S. F. B., & Muhaimin, Y. (2021). Efektivitas Metode Rekrutmen Melalui Media Sosial. *Information Science and Library*, 2(1), 45. <https://doi.org/10.26623/jisl.v2i1.3421>
- Lubis, L. S., & Nainggolan, N. P. (2019). Proses Rekrutmen dan seleksi Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan pada PT. Schneider Electric Manufacturing Batam. *Jurnal Akuntansi Bareleng*, 2(2019), 76–88. <https://ejournal.upbatam.ac.id/index.php/jab/article/view/1603>
- Sakti, S. H., Ikhsan, M., Abdoellah, M. N., Zabidi, I., & Anggara, A. (2023). Pengaruh rekrutmen SDM, penempatan dan komitmen kerja terhadap kinerja karyawan PT LT di Jakarta. *Jurnal Riset Manajemen Dan Bisnis*, 8(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.36407/jrmb.v8i1.1036>
- Wiyatna, A. P., & Kasman. (2019). Proses Rekrutmen Dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Organisasi. *Jurnal Ilmu Manajemen Universitas Galuh Ciamis*, 6(2), 381. <https://jurnal.unigal.ac.id/index.php/ekonologi>
- Yansen, A. (2024). Implementasi Kebijakan Rekrutmen dan Seleksi Pegawai dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Organisasi Pemerintah Daerah. *Journal of International Multidisciplinary Research*, 2(5), 514–527.